



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 78

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Second Legislature

Wednesday, February 10, 1993

The Speaker took the Chair at 2:30 p.m.

ROUTINE

Notices of Motions

Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Government House Leader, gave oral notice of the following motion:

Be it resolved that, when the Assembly adjourns to recess the Fourth Session of the 22nd Legislature, it shall stand adjourned until a time and date prior to the announcement of the Fifth Session of the Legislature as is determined by the Speaker after consultation with the Lieutenant Governor in Council.

Mr. Doyle, Hon. Member for West Yellowhead, gave oral notice of his intention to move the following motion under Standing Order 40:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly direct the Public Accounts Committee to hold such further meetings as are required to conduct a full and complete examination of the reasons for the financial losses of NovAtel Communications Ltd., after this session adjourns.

Introduction of Bills (First Reading)

Notice having been given:

Bill 348 Employment Standards Code Amendment Act, 1993 – Mr. Sigurdson

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Dinning, Provincial Treasurer:

Answer to Written Question 173 asked by Mr. Mitchell on January 28, 1993:

What is the estimate of the natural gas price upon which the Provincial Treasurer based his projection for natural gas and by-products royalty for 1990-91?

Sessional Paper 173/92-93

Answer to Written Question 348 asked by Mr. Mitchell on January 28, 1993:

What amount, if any, was invested by the Pension Fund in Principal Group; First Investors Corporation Ltd.; Associated Investors of Canada Ltd.; Northland Bank; or the Canadian Commercial Bank for each of the years 1981 to 1987?

Sessional Paper 348/92-93

Answer to Written Question 373 asked by Mr. Mitchell on January 28, 1993:

What is the projected U.S./Canadian dollar exchange rate underlying the 1992/93 provincial budget.

Sessional Paper 373/92-93

Return to Order of the Assembly No. 202 asked by Mr. McEachern on January 28, 1993:

The cost each year for the years 1981 through 1990 of all corporate tax expenditures administered by the Treasury Department which are not reported in the Public Accounts of Alberta.

Sessional Paper 202/92-93

Return to Order of the Assembly No. 234 asked by Mr. Mitchell on January 28, 1993:

A detailed breakdown of payments received by the Province of Alberta from the Government of Canada, under the Canada Assistance Plan, by department and by program component for the fiscal years, 1988, 1989, 1990, and 1991 (forecast) and 1992 (estimate).

Sessional Paper 234/92-93

Return to Order of the Assembly No. 272 asked by Mr. Decore on January 28, 1993:

Details of the payment of \$20,000 to Infometrica Ltd. by the Treasury Department during 1989-90.

Sessional Paper 272/92-93

Return to Order of the Assembly No. 313 asked by Mrs. Hewes on January 28, 1993:

What is the amount of tobacco tax revenue accruing to the Government for the fiscal year 1990-91 from the following sources: cigarettes, cigars, and loose tobacco?

Sessional Paper 313/92-93

Return to Order of the Assembly No. 362 asked by Mr. Bruseker on January 28, 1993:

A detailed breakdown of guaranteed loans, by company and amount provided, for the "other" category, as of December 31, 1991, as found on page 40 of the 1992 budget address.

Sessional Paper 362/92-93

Mr. Tannas, Hon. Member for Highwood:

Alberta Association of Registered Occupational Therapists, Annual Report 1990-91

Sessional Paper 1076/92-93

College of Chiropractors of Alberta, Annual Report 1991

Sessional Paper 1077/92-93

Mrs. Gagnon, Hon. Member for Calgary-McKnight:

Student Finance Board's Student Living Allowance Per Month Compared to the Cost of Housing

Sessional Paper 1075/92-93

Oral Question Period

During Oral Question Period, Mr. McInnis, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Jasper Place, filed the following:

Unsigned Letter, dated November 30, 1992, from Forestry, Lands and Wildlife, Forest Industry Development Division, to Robert Schuyler, Chief Executive Officer, Grande Alberta Paper Ltd.

Sessional Paper 1078/92-93

Speaker's Statement: Points of Order

The first matter yesterday was raised as a purported Point of Order by the Member for Fort McMurray and dealt with comments which supposedly took place in Question Period, comments as uttered by the Leader of the Official Opposition.

In rising to the purported Point of Order, the Member for Fort McMurray makes this statement, and I quote from page 2188 of Hansard

. . .during question period the Hon. Leader of the Opposition referred to what I refer to as a blasphemous and defamatory manner in making statements about an individual not in the House, in reference to Mr. Joe Dutton. I would like to inform all Hon. Members of the Assembly and particularly the Leader of the Opposition that while under the employ of the Alberta Government, Mr. Dutton represented the Government with the highest integrity and without any impropriety.

Having examined the record and I'm sure all Hon. Members have their copy of Hansard before them, you would see that the Leader of the Opposition did not make any statement that could be construed as being "blasphemous" and "defamatory". That is simply not accurate from the record.

However, in speaking to the Point of Order, the Leader of the Opposition did throw in another line and I quote, "A lot of foreign dignitaries lost their shirts because of Mr. Dutton."

If that is indeed accurate, the Chair is not in a position to know. At any rate, it would seem to have appeared after Mr. Dutton left the employ of the Government, and so it is that the second statement by the Member for Fort McMurray as to the credibility and integrity of Mr. Dutton while he was a Government employee still stands. There is no Point of Order because "blasphemous" and "defamatory" did not occur. Again, the Chair warns all Members the admonition of Beauchesne 409(7).

A question must adhere to the proprieties of the House, in terms of inferences, imputing motives or casting aspersions upon persons within the House or out of it.

The second Point of Order yesterday was indeed a very interesting exchange when it came back to examining the record of Hansard. It also points out the challenge to all Members of the House to be able to listen to what's occurring in debate and try to catch it all. In rising to the purported Point of Order the Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark specifically makes this quote, "The Premier said I had misled the House." Again, if Hon. Members would be good enough to check what indeed was said in Hansard, they will discover that that quote, as supplied to the Assembly by the Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, is not accurate, that no such statement was made by the Premier in either the first or second replies, nor in speaking to the purported Point of Order.

However, in examining what did take place, the Chair would point out to the Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark in particular that on page 2184, the Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark makes this statement:

Will the Premier please tell us what exactly he is afraid of that he would stoop in this way to muzzling the Ethics Commissioner?

By this comment Edmonton-Meadowlark has been guilty of his own charge with respect to Standing Order 23(h), "makes allegations against another member," and also Standing Order 23(i), which "imputes false or unavowed motives to another member." So in this case there is indeed a Point of Order, but in actual fact it's against the Member who raised the Point of Order, Edmonton-Meadowlark, not against the Premier. The Chair therefore requests the Hon. Member to withdraw the statement, "stoop in this way to muzzling the Ethics Commissioner."

Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, withdrew the offending phrase.

Motions Under Standing Order 40

Mr. Doyle, Hon. Member for West Yellowhead, requested the unanimous consent of the Assembly for consideration of the following motion:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly direct the Public Accounts Committee to hold such further meetings as are required to conduct a full and complete examination of the reasons for the financial losses of NovAtel Communications Ltd., after this session adjourns.

Unanimous consent to proceed was not granted.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Motions

36. Hon. Mr. Klein moved on behalf of Hon. Mr. Evans:

Whereas the Province of Alberta wishes to enhance relations with First Nations located in Alberta;

And whereas the Grand Council of Treaty 8 First Nations has indicated that it wishes to enhance relations with the Province of Alberta;

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government of Alberta to:

- (1) enter into an agreement with the Grand Council of Treaty 8 First Nations to establish a process for dialogue to facilitate consultation regarding policies, programs and services affecting the First Nations located in Alberta who are signatories to Treaty 8;

- (2) ensure that any agreements resulting from this resolution will be consistent with the provisions of the Constitution of Canada and, in particular, shall not be construed so as to abrogate or derogate from any Aboriginal or treaty rights of First Nations or their members;
- (3) ensure that this resolution and agreements resulting from it do not diminish the special relationship First Nations have with the Government of Canada; and
- (4) indicate their willingness, upon request, to enter into similar processes of dialogue with treaty organizations which represent, respectively, the First Nations located in Alberta who are signatory to Treaty 6 and Treaty 7.

A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to unanimously.

Government Bills and Orders

Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole.

(Assembly in Committee)

Hon. Mr. Day, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that pursuant to Standing Order 21, further consideration of Bill 55, Electoral Divisions Statutes Amendment Act, 1993, shall be the first business of the Committee of the Whole and shall not be further postponed.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 37

| | | |
|-----------|---------------------|------------|
| Adair | Evans | Moore |
| Ady | Fischer | Nelson |
| Anderson | Fjordbotten | Paszkowski |
| Betkowski | Gogo | Payne |
| Black | Hyland | Rostad |
| Bogle | Isley | Sparrow |
| Bradley | Kowalski | Stewart |
| Brassard | Laing (Calgary-Bow) | Tannas |
| Cherry | Lund | Thurber |
| Clegg | Main | Weiss |
| Day | McClellan | West |
| Dinning | McFarland | Zarusky |
| Elzinga | | |

Against the motion: 19

| | | |
|----------|---------------------------|-----------|
| Barrett | Gibeault | Mitchell |
| Bruseker | Hewes | Mjolsness |
| Chivers | Laing (Edmonton-Avonmore) | Sigurdson |
| Doyle | Martin | Taylor |
| Ewasiuk | McEachern | Wickman |
| Fox | McInnis | Woloshyn |
| Gagnon | | |

The following Bill was taken under consideration:

Bill 55 Electoral Divisions Statutes Amendment Act, 1993 – Hon. Mr. Fowler

A debate followed.

At 5:27 p.m., pursuant to Standing Order 21, the question was put on the motion that the Bill be reported, which was agreed to.

And after some further time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker assumed the Chair.

The following Bill was reported with some amendments:

Bill 55 Electoral Divisions Statutes Amendment Act, 1993 – Hon. Mr. Fowler

Mr. Main, Deputy Chairman of Committees, tabled copies of all amendments considered by the Committee of the Whole this date.

Amendment to Bill 55 (Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie) - Defeated
Sessional Paper 690/92-93

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Day, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 5:28 p.m. until Thursday, February 11, 1993, at 2:30 p.m.

NOTICES

Leave to Introduce a Bill

Bill 3 Vencap Equities Alberta Amendment Act, 1992 – Hon. Mr. Elzinga
Bill 44 Employment Standards Code Amendment Act, 1992 – Hon. Ms McCoy
Bill 49 Industrial Wages Security Amendment Act, 1992 – Hon. Ms McCoy
Bill 230 Employment Standards Act – Mr. Bruseker

| | | |
|------|-----|--|
| Bill | 239 | Alberta Economic Diversification Board Act – Mr. Bruseker |
| Bill | 241 | Below Cost Timber Sales Act – Mr. McInnis |
| Bill | 244 | Child Welfare Amendment Act – Ms Mjolsness |
| Bill | 246 | Decommissioning of Industrial Sites Act – Mr. Mitchell |
| Bill | 247 | Alberta Retirement Savings Plan Act – Mr. Jonson |
| Bill | 248 | Financial Administration Amendment Act – Mr. Decore |
| Bill | 251 | Alberta Youth Conservation Act – Mrs. Gagnon |
| Bill | 253 | Child Welfare Amendment Act – Ms Mjolsness |
| Bill | 255 | Amusements Amendment Act – Mrs. Gagnon |
| Bill | 257 | Alberta Local Development Bonds Act – Mr. Jonson |
| Bill | 263 | Labour Relations Code Amendment Act – Mr. Bruseker |
| Bill | 265 | Interprovincial Lottery Amendment Act – Mr. Decore |
| Bill | 270 | Small Business Support Act – Ms Calahasen |
| Bill | 272 | An Act to Establish the Alberta Innovation Foundation – Mr. Bradley |
| Bill | 275 | Off-Highway Vehicle Amendment Act – Mr. Bradley |
| Bill | 283 | Arts Council Act – Mrs. Gagnon |
| Bill | 285 | Public Service Employee Relations Amendment Act – Mr. Bruseker |
| Bill | 286 | Highway Traffic Amendment Act – Mrs. Mirosh |
| Bill | 287 | An Act to Establish a Committee to Promote a Split Peak Rate Assessment for Industrial Energy Consumers – Mr. Paszkowski |
| Bill | 293 | Public Accounts Committee Act – Mr. Pashak |
| Bill | 295 | Auditor General Amendment Act – Mr. Decore |
| Bill | 296 | Entrepreneurial Education Commission Act – Mr. Paszkowski |
| Bill | 301 | An Act to Phase Out the Use of Chlorofluorocarbons – Mr. Mitchell |
| Bill | 309 | School Amendment Act – Mrs. Gagnon |
| Bill | 312 | Crown Property Municipal Grants Amendment Act – Mr. Wickman |
| Bill | 313 | Auditor General Amendment Act – Mr. Pashak |
| Bill | 314 | Income Tax Amendment Act – Mr. Wickman |
| Bill | 315 | An Act to Commit Government to a Five-Year Funding Planning Framework – Mr. Wickman |
| Bill | 317 | Miscellaneous Statutes on Marital Status Amendment Act – Ms Laing |

- Bill 320 An Act to Provide for Elected Representation on Post-Secondary Education Institute Boards – Mr. Pashak
- Bill 328 Liquor Control Amendment Act, 1992 – Mr. Taylor
- Bill 331 Teaching Profession Amendment Act, 1992 – Mr. Severtson
- Bill 341 Limitations of Actions Amendment Act, 1993 – Mr. Dickson
- Bill 349 Emblems of Alberta Amendment Act, 1993 – Mr. Lund

David J. Carter,
Speaker

Title: Wednesday, February 10, 1993